Julia Stachura

DOUBLE INDEX. THE SELF-SHADOW IN AMERICAN PHOTOGRAPHY OF THE SECOND HALF OF THE 20TH CENTURY

> Our conception of history – Hegel's, that is – and our conception of representation – Plato's in fact – have enabled and encouraged us to approach the history of light from different angles but have circumvented the possibility of a history of the shadow […].
>
> *Victor Stoichita*[1]

The subject of this article is the self-shadow, understood as the shadow of the creator visible in a self-portrait, in American photography during the second half of the 20th century. Although it is clear to everyone what a shadow is, one would search in vain for a definition of the self-shadow in the dictionary. This term was coined for the purpose of analyzing four works, each of which depict different types of this model of representation. The self-shadow, as the name suggests, connects the shadow with the self-portrait, and thus brings together the symbolism and history of the shadow with subjective and creative self-expression. The cultural history of the subject in question grew out of legends and myths that speak of the shadow and its magical and creative power. One of the most important legends is the myth of the origin of the image. It appears in several versions throughout the history of writing about art, acknowledging either a woman or a man as the protagonist. One of them, described by Pliny, is the story of Butades' daughter, Kora of Sicyon. While key roles are played by desire, loss and memory[2] in it, the shadow becomes the basis for the image of her beloved – traced on the wall, it substitutes for the presence of the man. The problem of image formation through the visuality of the

[1] V. Stoichita, *A Short History of the Shadow*, trans. A.M. Glasheen, London 1997, p. 8.

[2] See: Pliny, *The Natural History*, Book XXXV, trans. H. Rackham, London 1952.

Artium Quaestiones 33, 2022: 279–299 © The Author(s), Adam Mickiewicz University Press, 2022.

shadow can also be found in Ovid's account of the myth of Narcissus, at the root of which are image-reflection and image-shadow.[3] In Platonic philosophy, the shadow was classified as a low category of images, or eidolons, associated with passive sensory perception and located on the opposite end of the spectrum from ideas.[4] The body-shadow relationship, relevant to the problem at hand, is a presence-absence relationship. According to Plato, the shadow will never be as good as the body because it does not tell us whether it is a reflection of a two-dimensional or three-dimensional object, and it distorts proportion and distance. Eventually, the deceptive shadow gave way to the mimetically more perfect mirror reflection.[5] It can be said that the self-shadow is situated on the border of difference and similarity – it is a schematic image that does not reveal the individuality of its owner, but is a two-dimensional copy of the body which successfully renders the figure's silhouette.

Two main issues prompted me to write this article. The first is the dearth of up-to-date theoretical studies of the problem of the shadow throughout the history of photography from an art-historical perspective. The second is that the phenomenon of the self-shadow and its possible variants in self-portrait photography remain undefined. Although there are many examples of studies of the history of the shadow,[6] the problem of the self-shadow (if it is addressed at all) is most often a marginal theme. One of the most important books devoted to the issue is *A Short History of the Shadow*, by Romanian researcher Victor I. Stoichita, published in 1997 (and in 2001 in Poland). Stoichita evokes and interprets four self-portraits that feature the shadows of their creators, one by each of Claude Monet, Alfred Stieglitz, André Kertész and Andy Warhol. In the case of the latter, in the chapter *In the Shadow of the Eternal Return*, the researcher "anthropologizes" the artist's shadow, describing it as a "second self", a "doubled image of a human", a "layer", a "specter", "the other."[7] The elementary, vitalistic relationship linking the human body with its shadow is only a starting point for considering the complexity of its essence and symbolism. The categories mentioned by the researcher inspired the organization of the visual material in this article, mainly covering the 1960s and 1980s in American photography. The key to the selection of artists was

---

[3] See: Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, trans. A.S. Kline, Virginia 2004.

[4] Plato, *The Republic*, trans. D. Lee, London 2007.

[5] Stoichita, *A Short…*, p. 25.

[6] See: M. Baxandall, *Shadows and Enlightenment*, New Haven–London 1995 and E.H. Gombrich, *The Depiction of Cast Shadows in Western Art*, London 1995. The most up-to-date proposal is a book by Roberto Casati and Patrick Cavanagh – *The Visual World of Shadows* from 2019, written from a cognitive psychology and philosophy perspective.

[7] Stoichita, *A Short…*, pp. 147–192.

the actualization, and occasional subversion, of the myths associated with the shadow, as well as the visual-semantic diversity of the addressed issues of memory, race, identity or subjectivity in general. In this regard, it will be important to analyze the strategies of depicting the presence of the artist in photography, both in isolation from (and often in opposition to) the traditional model of body representation and in relation to it. In no way does focusing on American photography mean that the self-shadow phenomenon is limited to one geographic area or specific decade.[8] The cultural framework I have adopted is an extension of my previous research,[9] while the works discussed exemplify different types of self-shadow imagery. The purpose of this text, therefore, is to reveal the theoretical potential of the concept, based on self-portraits by Lee Friedlander, Shawn Walker, Andy Warhol and Nan Goldin. The titles of each part ("Reflection", "The Invisible Man", "The Twin and the Mask", and "Diary") will point to a broader understanding of the shadow and bring us closer to a definition of the self-shadow (though certainly not an exhaustive one). The analyses will be linked to the concepts of the philosophical-psychological distinction between "the self" and "the other", Jung's archetypal theory, and the concept of narcissistic identification. Complementing the methodological framework will be the tropes of hybrid ontology of the shadow and the concept of index. The first concept, coined by Hagi Kanaan, implies two triads linking the shadow to its mythical origins: presence, absence and re-production, and the object of desire, loss and substitution.[10] For this philosopher, the hybrid ontology of the shadow implies both its visibility and visuality. Kanaan's classification draws on two analytical categories proposed by Georges Didi-Huberman. The first refers to the tradition of imagery, while the second refers to that which transcends it, i.e. imaginings, memory, and endogenous images.[11] In this understanding, the shadow not only testifies to the physical body, present here and now, but also evokes a sense of loss, absence, lacking and emptiness – feelings that are pictorially intangible. Relating the preceding statements to the self-portrait, and therefore the expression of artistic sub-

[8] There are numerous known European photographs of self-shadows, such as the self-portraits of André Kertész, Andrzej Lachowicz and Olive Cotton, which were taken in both the first half of the 20th century and after World War II.

[9] My master's thesis "Out of Disobedience. Self-Shadow in American Photography of the Second Half of the 20th Century" was dedicated to the issue discussed in the article.

[10] H. Kanaan, *Photography and Its Shadow*, Palo Alto 2020, p. 546.

[11] See: G. Didi-Huberman, "The History of Art Within the Limits of Its Simple Practice", in: *Confronting Image: Questioning the Ends of a Certain History of Art*, trans. J. Goodman, Pennsylvania 2004, pp. 11–52.

jectivity, will bring to the self-shadow the distinctive dual vision[12] of the creators, absent/present in the photograph and present outside the frame. The second concept I will use is the index,[13] one of the oldest photographic topoi, establishing its meaning on the axis of its physical relationship to the object of reference. Therefore, it is referred to as a trace, mark and shifter, varying according to the sender and the message.[14] Much as in Kanaan's theory, the index takes duplication and a cause-and-effect relationship as its basis, while problematizing the status of the subject, suspended between presence and absence. It is also no coincidence that I relate this concept to selected American works from the second half of the 20th century, bearing in mind Rosalind Krauss' canonical 1977 text *Notes on the Index: Seventies Art in America*. Moreover, I propose to perceive the self-shadow as a double index, that is, an image leaving its mark both in reality and on light-sensitive matter, while taking into account its visually universal characteristics. After all, it is difficult to call the self-shadow a likeness in the traditional sense. Taking this approach is meant to not so much bring out the specificity of photography from the issue at hand (the index has served many researchers in their attempts to justify the truth and objectivity of the medium[15]) as to point out the paradoxical and special status of the self-shadow in the context of self-portraiture and self-presentation.

REFLECTION

The aforementioned stage of image formation present in the myth of Narcissus exemplifies the problem of the self-shadow and likeness. In Ovid's version of the myth, he writes "drinking, he's overcome by the beauty of the

---

[12] The notion of doubled/dual vision is used primarily by postcolonial theorists, who refer to the experience of the racialized subject navigating between identities produced by, among other things, colonial power dynamics. In the context of the self-shadow, a concept that is heterogeneous but not necessarily the same as race, double vision refers to the general experience of an identity crisis or an expression of the search for a place in the world.

[13] R. Krauss, "Notes on the Index: Seventies Art in America", *October* 1977, 3, pp. 68–81, available online: <https://doi.org/10.2307/778437>.

[14] See: M.A. Doane, "Indexicality: Trace and Sign: Introduction", *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 2007, 1(18), pp. 1–6 and M.A. Doane, "The Indexical and the Concept of Medium Specificity", *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 2007, 1(18), pp. 128–152.

[15] W. Kanicki, among others, writes about this photographic paradigm in his book *Ujemny biegun fotografii. Negatywowe obrazy w sztuce nowoczesnej*, Gdańsk 2016.

image that he sees; he falls in love with an immaterial hope, a shadow that he wrongly takes for substance."[16] Reflection, although mainly associated with the mirror, is also linked to the self-shadow and its mythical image-creative origins. Both forms of representation are transient, changeable, illusive and lack materiality. Stoichita points out that for many centuries artists avoided depicting the "shadow stage" because of the lack of a clear correspondence between the shadow and the self, which in the case of reflection seemed natural.[17] At the same time, in later translations of the myth, the interaction between the two concepts was maintained.[18] The tension between (self)shadow and reflection, then, can be likened to a game between "the self" and "the other", understood as visual tropes of subject demarcation that refer to the story of Narcissus.

The aforementioned relationship was a regular motif in the self-portrait oeuvre of Lee Friedlander,[19] who encapsulated it in the photo-album *In the Picture: Self-Portraits 1958–2011*, in which the self-shadow portraits and the other portrait photographs form two parallel and equal narratives. A visit to Kentucky in 1969 resulted in one of the more complex shots in the photographer's oeuvre. Brilliantly illustrating the relationship discussed here between the self-shadow and reflection, the *Kentucky* photograph (ill. 1) shows both the artist's shadow and his reflection in the glass protecting a trophy with a winged, Nike-type figure. Residential buildings, a street lamp and a fragment of the sky can be seen in the scene's background. This photograph emphasizes twinning, expressed both in the two Friedlanders (in the form of a shadow and a reflection) and in the division of the composition into a shadow zone and a light zone. Visible on the curtain, a line running near the figure's wings separates the reflection of the bust from the shadow of the head. The shadow is cast on the illuminated statue in the lower register of the photograph. The photograph not only shows two ontological opposites, light and darkness but also three- and two-dimensionality, manifested by reflection and shadow, respectively. Both images successfully capture the silhouette of the artist; however, the shadow undergoes a slight anamorphosis. By virtue of its flatness, it lays inside the display, seemingly penetrating the window, while the reflection remains on the glass and does not have visual access to the statuette.

---

[16] Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, verses 407–417. In original: *dumque bibit, visae correptus imagine formae, spem sine corpore amat, corpus putat esse, quod umbra est.*

[17] Stoichita, *A Short…*, p. 32.

[18] Ibidem, p. 33.

[19] Lee Friedlander, born in 1934.

1. Photograph of the book *In the Picture. Self-Portraits 1958–2011*, Lee Friedlander, Yale University Art Gallery 2011, [Lee Friedlander, 88. *Kentucky*, 1969]

This shot is evocative of Rene Magritte's 1937 painting, *Not to Be Reproduced*, depicting Edward James, in which both his figures – one in front of the mirror and one reflected – are seen from behind. Magritte's painting and Friedlander's photograph have much in common: the doubling of the figure, the mystery, being both inside and outside, and the simultaneous presence of reflection and shadow. The last aspect is not as apparent in the painting as in Friedlander's photo. However, the shadow cast by James clearly falls on the stone ledge, thus joining the reflection. Moreover, this shadow continues onto the other side of the mirror, thus becoming its mirrored counterpart. Friedlander draws a much clearer line between the two images, but raises the same concerns – the conflicted and reproduced self, the shattered identity, and the blurred relationship between "the self" and "the other".

In the context of Friedlander's self-portraits, Surya Bowyer applies the concept of unreadability, while pointing to the collapsing of boundaries between foreground and background, spatial relations and the distinction between interior and exterior.[20] This manipulation of reflections, framing

[20] S. Bowyer, "Seeing Double: The Subject of Vision in Lee Friedlander's Self-Portraiture", *photographies* 2020, 13(3), pp. 323–339. See also: V. Burgin, "Looking at Photographs", in: *Thinking Photography*, ed. V. Burgin, London 1982, pp. 142–153.

and overlapping of visual layers have become the artist's signature practices. Bowyer proposes reading Friedlander's shadow/reflection photographs through the concept of the stain.[21] In the Lacanian system, the stain is part of the gaze and thus of the cognitive apparatus, preparing the subject to participate in culture.[22] Using this notion to analyze Friedlander's self-portrait reveals two fundamental issues of the self-shadow in photography – the performance of the identity categories of "the self" and "the other" and its camouflaging abilities. The strong presence of a reflective surface – glass which functions like a mirror – allows the artist to confront the images of himself. Thus, the photographer is literally "watched"[23] by two likenesses which mask his real face. It is worth recalling that Lacan associates the concept of mimicry, and thus adaptation and camouflage, with the stain.[24] In the context of the relationship between shadow and reflection, the stain would indicate not difference, but similarity. Thus, returning once again to the myth of Narcissus, the shadow can be treated as a camouflaged reflection. Kaja Silverman built on this Lacanian notion by elaborating on the thread of the relationship between "the self" and "the other". Following Silverman's reasoning, the stain eliminates the distance between the two identity categories, just as it eliminates the boundary between body and image.[25] With the present considerations in mind, the self-shadow in Friedlander's photography can be considered as a distortion in the field of vision, failing to distinguish between shadow and reflection, and further, between "the self" and "the other". The artist's vision of identity representation is, in fact, a union of two twin categories, which function in the same space and on the same surface. The stain fits in with the concepts of hybrid ontology as well as the double index – it is mimic, and therefore imitative, and thus capable of both duplicating and shifting meaning. In this respect, the duplicated meaning is not a copy but a repetition with a shift,[26] just like the self-shadow, which

---

[21] Ibidem, p. 323.

[22] G. Baker, "The Space of the Stain", *Grey Room* 2001, 5, pp. 7–37.

[23] This is a reference to Lacan's theory of object-subject relations and the gaze turning toward the perceiver – "I am *photo-graphed*". See J. Lacan, *Seminar IX: Identification*, London 2002, p. 106.

[24] In Four Fundamental Concepts, Lacan writes about the caprella (a species of skeleton- or plant-resembling shrimp in the family Caprellidae), comparing the animal's imitative abilities to a stain and describing the possibilities of inscribing itself onto a picture, which, according to the philosopher, gives rise to mimicry. See K. Silverman, *The Threshold of the Visible World*, New York–London 1996, p. 201.

[25] Ibidem, pp. 201–202.

[26] H. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture*, London 2004.

is a duplication of the human silhouette, albeit flat and disembodied. Further captured in a photograph, it is yet another repetition, one that does not occur without manipulations of frame or perspective, both of which affect its final image. The doubled seeing in this case refers not so much to the tension between the photographer's self-shadow and bodily presence in and out of the frame but to the possibility of seeing one's own reflection in the shadow. In this respect, much as in Magritte's painting, Friedlander's two images come to resemble a surreal confrontation in which the self and the other become one.

THE INVISIBLE MAN

A slightly different form of self-portraiture in urban space is tackled by Shawn Walker[27] in *The Invisible Man Series*. The recent exhibition *Working Together: Louis Draper and the Kamoinge Workshop* (2020)[28] at the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts [VMFA], recalled the work of the prominent African-American collective Kamoinge Workshop,[29] founded in New York in 1963. The theme of the self-shadow became a form of expression for the group, conveying the identity status and social invisibility of Black artists. Louis Draper, Anthony Barboza, Beuford Smith, Ming Smith, and the aforementioned Shawn Walker turned toward their own shadows. The latter's work, presented in a segment of the VMFA exhibition titled *Shadows, Reflections and Abstractions*,[30] came from a closed series of twenty photographs

---

[27] Shawn Walker, born in 1940. „The Invisible Man" series was digitized and published on: <https://www.photographypreservation.org/shawn-walker>.

[28] The exhibition has moved to the Whitney Museum of American Art under a modified title: *Working Together: The Photographers of the Kamoinge Workshop.*

[29] The group was centered around Louis Draper, a photographer-mentor and university teacher. Community and equality were embedded in the collective's practice from the beginning. The name Kamoinge Workshop was taken from Gikuyu, the language of the Kikuyu tribe of Kenya, and means "people acting and working together" or family. See S.L. Eckhardt, "An Introduction to Working Together", in: *Working Together: Louis Draper and the Kamoinge Workshop*, ed. S. Eckhardt, Durham 2020, pp. 9–15.

[30] The concept of the exhibition was based on the archive brought to the VMFA by L. Draper's sister in 2012. From the photographer's thematically rich body of work, the curator (Sarah Eckhardt) highlighted five core sections (*Community, The Civil Rights Movement, A Global Perspective, Akin to Jazz, and Shadows, Reflections and Abstractions*), representative of both the mentor and his students, i.e. the other thirteen members of the collective.

that paid homage to Ralph Ellison's canonical 1952 novel, *The Invisible Man*. The photographs in the series were created in the 1980s and 1990s. Walker did not date or title the individual shots, thus emphasizing the synchronicity of events in the story of the invisible and nameless man roaming the streets of Harlem.

For Walker, *The Invisible Man Series* is a combination of social commentary, cultural anthropology and art.[31] All of these elements were meant to testify to who the African-American of the late 20th and early 21st centuries is. For Deba P. Patnaik, the photographer's work became representative of the socio-artistic construct of "diasporic double vision."[32] According to the author, his self-portraits illustrate the ambivalent and dual status of the Black[33] subject in America, aware of both his hyper-visibility and invisibility. The researcher characterizes the artist's photographs as complex tableaux, where shadows intermingle with other elements of photography, creating works of art rich in meanings.[34] The fundamental question that arises in dealing with the artist's photographs is one concerning invisibility, and thus visuality beyond the traditionally understood models of representation. How should it be shown? Walker found the answer to be the shadow.

One of the most interesting works in *The Invisible Man Series* is an untitled shot showing the artist's shadow cast on rain-soaked asphalt. In this way, Walker alludes to the well-known Narcissus visual topos, and also points to the similarity of the status of the self-shadow to the natural process of evaporation, a form of vaporization. Noteworthy, the term "vaporization" was used by George Orwell in his novel '*1984*' to describe the process of erasing a name from the pages of history. In the context of the theme addressed here, namely African-Americans' invisibility, the association prompts reflection on the existing narrative around the Black subject. By being projected onto the rough asphalt, the artist's shadow seems to lose its integrity. Such a treatment of the self-shadow underscores its temporal nature and reminds us of its fleetingness and transience. When viewing this photograph, one should also pay attention to the abstractness of the forms depicted in the shot's central band. The bright spots on the water, swirling

---

[31] S.W. Walker, *Shadows and Reflections/Self-Portraits, Artist's Statement*, 1996, courtesy of the artist, pp. 1–2.

[32] D.P. Patnaik, "Diasporic Double Vision, in: Committed to the Image", *Contemporary Black Photographers*, ed. B. Head Millstein, New York 2001, p. 34.

[33] Black, capitalized, emphasizes subjectivity and the shared history and identity of the African-American community.

[34] Patnaik, "Diasporic…", p. 38.

in frothy eddies from the left edge of the photograph to the center, are reminiscent of soap or some other chemical substance that produces a similar effect. Glittering with sparkling particles, the sheet of water filling the frame and covering the asphalt is reminiscent of volcanic rock. Thanks to the high contrast, the artist has achieved an almost printmaking effect, reminiscent of layering – a lithographic technique designed to make it more lifelike and deepen three-dimensionality of the work.

The moment in which Walker views himself in his shadow that is captured in the photograph is a direct reference to the story of Narcissus. As is the case with Friedlander's work, the sight of the shadow is not a transposition of the moment of falling in love with one's image, but a moment of identity dilemma – in this case, the realization of one's invisibility. In her text *The Narcissus Effect*, Marta Smolinska points to another interesting concept in the classic myth. The scene in Ovid's *Metamorphoses* not only conveys the ephemerality and impermanence of the image, conjured in water, but also tells of the curse of the goddess Nemesis, who transformed Narcissus' life from the moment he glimpsed himself in his reflection/own shadow.[35] In the story, the protagonist's contemplation of the image was combined with a contemplation of his own fate. Walker's photography seems to speak of a similar relationship. The artist, experiencing urban space and, metaphorically, life in society, turns to the shadow – an image that is a representation of the inner experience he faces.

Significantly, it is only in the title of the series, itself a reference to a novel, that the racialization of the subject in Walker's photograph is expressed. After all, the self-shadow does not betray skin color, it is a universal visual index. The aforementioned "doubled vision", characteristic of the tension between the artist's absence and presence in the photograph, can also be applied to language, and more broadly to the culture that frames the racialized subject, even when there is no visible evidence that the person in the shot is a Black man. This also relates to the choice of using a photographic medium, which, as a rule, preserves the image on light-sensitive matter. If we return to the issue of the double index, the photographer's self-portrait is an attempt to answer the question of the properties of the shadow's imprint (or image). The photograph demonstrates that the self-shadow is associated with the water's surface, and thus belongs among ephemeral, deceptive images. Moreover, keeping in mind the story of Narcissus, it is a fluid image capable of transformation that can be brought about not only by natural factors

[35] M. Smolińska, "Efekt Narcyza. Metanarcyzm w sztuce wideo(instalacji)", in: *Projekt Narcyz*, ed. A. Bednarczyk, Cracow 2017, p. 175.

but also by the touch of its owner stirring the surface to life. There is a perceptible detachment in Walker's photograph. His likeness occupies the lower register of the frame and seems to "give way" to abstract foam shapes whose swirling patterns nevertheless surround the photographer's silhouette. This both emphasizes and isolates the shadow in the photograph. Metaphorically, such an arrangement can be applied to the social (in)visibility addressed by the title character of the series. The structure of the imprint – the characteristic outline of the self-shadow – is also problematized by distinctly jagged, gradually disintegrating contours. Replacing corporeal presence within the frame with the ambivalence of the subject's experience of invisibility, freed the artist from traditional ways of depicting the black body in photographic self-portraits. Walker, on the one hand, works through his racialization, while on the other hand, he invokes the general concept of identity, going beyond the "epidermal schema."[36] The invisible man is suspended between the problems affecting a specific community and the universalizing topos of finding a place in the world.

THE TWIN AND THE MASK

Andy Warhol[37] took a different approach to presenting his self-shadow in photography. As Stoichita points out, the American's self-portraits show the "dramatic relationship of post-modernist polymerized man."[38] In the case of Warhol's self-shadow, the representation in the model is based on the play between the self, the twin shadow, and the superimposed mask. Stoichita refers to this particular interest in doubling and repetition as "polymerization" and uses the term "second self". The "polymeric image" reflects the artist's ever-multiplying images, which, in effect, merge into unity.[39] "Second self" functions as a construct derived from psychoanalysis. In Jungian terms, the shadow is one of the archetypes and is identified with the dark aspects of personality as well as with emotions and affects. The shadow step is one of the most important in self-discovery, or individuation, that is, the long-term process of establishing one's identity.[40] These issues closely parallel those in the

---

[36] F. Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks*, trans. C.L. Markman, London 1986, p. 112.

[37] Andy Warhol born 1928, died 1987.

[38] Stoichita, *A Short…*, p. 213.

[39] Ibidem, p. 211.

[40] C.G. Jung, *Man and His Symbols*, New York–London–Toronto–Sydney–Auckland 1964, pp. 18–103.

aforementioned photograph by Friedlander, where the status of the self-shadow was suspended between the categories of "the self" and "the other". In this case, producing twin versions and masks, shifted in relation to each other in both the visual and semantic layer, becomes significant.

In the 1960s, when he was establishing himself as an artist, Andy Warhol built the foundation for what, in the late 1970s, scholars would call "avant-garde Warhol". At the outset of his work as a photographer, he chose to work with a Polaroid camera – a technological assistant that would "do the rest for you."[41] The camera suited him well: it was a relatively egalitarian recording instrument present in many American homes. The artist was extremely prolific in this field. As a budding photographer, he alluded to modernist utopias – the ruthless automation of the photographic process and the Taylorization of image production. In 1963, the artist uttered the significant words, "I want to be a machine."[42] That same year saw one of his earliest Polaroid self-portraits, in which Warhol showed both a shadow-twin and a shadow-mask. The photograph, in a traditional portrait shot, shows the artist sitting in front of a white canvas in a studio, facing the camera (ill. 2). Warhol is dressed in a black sweater, from under which the collar of a white shirt protrudes. His look is completed with a pair of glasses. His twin is visible on the canvas behind the artist. This self-shadow is doubled – there is a noticeably darker and proportionally smaller shadow outlining the photographer's silhouette, and a lighter, slightly larger one which is significantly distorted. It can be said that even Warhol's shadow has a shadow, which not only testifies to the repetitiveness of this image, but also to the aforementioned visual-meaning shift, as the larger shadow is characterized by anamorphosis as well as "fading". The fact that the twin self-shadows were projected onto canvas is reminiscent of Warhol's serigraphic series of paintings. In a sense, they mimic the mechanical repetitions of printing, which depend on the location of the matrix and the intensity of the ink.

One of the first large-format screen prints, titled *Cagney*, from 1962, depicting the actor and dancer James Cagney in a cropped stop-frame from the 1938 gangster film *Angels with Dirty Faces*, gives an idea about the origins of the twin self-shadow image in Warhol's work. Cagney's shadow stretches behind him against the wall, echoing the gesture of his bent arm holding a revolver. Thanks to the visual support provided by the shadow, the actor's silhouette appears greatly enlarged. The joining of Cagney to his negative

---

[41] See: P. Buse, *The Camera Does the Rest. How Polaroid Changed Photography*, Chicago 2016.

[42] G.R. Swenson, "What is Pop Art? Answers from 8 Painters", *Art News* 1963, 62, p. 26.

2. Andy Warhol, *Andy Warhol*, 1963, Polaroid Type 42/44/47, 10.7 x 8.2 cm, from *Andy Warhol. Polaroids 1958–1987*, courtesy of The Andy Warhol Foundation for the Visual Arts

twin is particularly emphasized at head level. The protagonist appears to be defending his own shadow against an enemy. The outline of the enemy's gun, located on the left side of the depiction, almost touches Cagney, coming dangerously close to his side. The presence of the actor's black silhouette gives the impression that the specter of death is awaiting the revolver's shot.

Warhol, like Cagney, has placed himself against a metaphorical wall, a canvas, but a different kind of weapon is aimed at him – a camera. A shadow-mask is superimposed on Warhol's face, dividing his countenance into a zone of darkness and a zone of light. A *punctum*[43] in the form of a black mark in place of the artist's eye is on the dark side. Although the source of this detail in the photograph is unknown, it resembles a cigarette burn, and

[43] *Punctum* in Barthesian theory is referred to as a "prick", "detail", "accident", "sting", "speck" and "cut", and thus an element that attracts the attention of the observer (also called spectator). See R. Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. R. Howard, New York 1981.

metaphorically, a bullet hole. Thus, we see the looking eye on the illuminated side, while the blackened eye is on the shadow side. This can be associated with the symbolic darkening of vision, with the degradation of its principle and the lowering of its status. Different senses are associated with the shadow side, those oriented toward touch and materiality, which is emphasized by the deliberate destruction of the photo. Warhol seems to have made a dozen sweeping lines near the "bullet hole" mark, thereby ruining the smooth surface of the photo. Given that this photograph is relatively small, he must have made them with a fine, sharp tool, perhaps scissors. Much of the scratching is on the shadow-mask side, in contrast to the pristine, illuminated part of the face. This signals that the blurring of the boundaries between the machine production of the image and the causality of the hand is associated with the shadow. In addition, in the body portion, Warhol's self-shadow takes on an almost graphic or painterly quality – it seems as if the marks defining the silhouette in the lower portion were created moments before the final image appeared. This brings to mind painting's origin myth and the figure of Butades' daughter tracing the outline of her beloved's shadow. In the case of the photograph in question, this can be read as both an expression of narcissistic self-love and an expression of the love of images. In this context, Warhol captured on a white canvas background also evokes associations with the portrait of Dorian Gray. This is not only a reference to the queer icon Oscar Wilde, but more importantly to the story of the aging painting. Photography is meant to ensure the immortality of the artist's image; however, this one seems to disobey, as it decays and blurs the line between the face held in a deadpan expression, and the sense of a hidden dark secret. In a way, Warhol's portrait resembles a multiple exposure photograph, in which he seems to record "moments of his own existence."[44] The dynamic shadows in the individual portions of the split self-portrait contrast with the calm and steady posture of the artist. The double index of the self-shadow in this case is much more complex – the photograph shows a shifted shadow "wandering" with the lighting, a shadow cast on the face, and one (presumably) marked by fingerprints before the emulsion dried.

The dominant narrative in Warhol's art was frequently based on the notion of simulacra, appearances and superficiality.[45] The artist himself used to say that he was nothing more than an "image", a "mirror" and "a magnet for the

---

[44] M. Michałowska, *Obraz utajony. Szkice o fotografii i pamięci*, Cracow 2007, p. 75.

[45] H. Foster, "The Return of the Real", in: *The Return of the Real. The Avant-Garde at the End of the Century*, Cambridge–London 1996, p. 128.

desires of others."[46] If one were to accept these declarations, one should consider what Warhol's art was supposed to reflect. Here it is necessary to mention the cultural and political context of the early 1960s. The self-portrait I am analyzing was created a year after the tragic death of Marilyn Monroe. In the same year, President John F. Kennedy was shot, and Warhol began to create his famous works: *Ambulance Disaster*, *White Burning Car* and *Race Riot*, in response to the shocking events reported in the press and on television. The repeatedly reproduced photographs used by Warhol recalled the recurring motto "I want to be a machine". Although the 1963 Polaroid does not directly comment on any of the events mentioned above, it seems, like no other, to show the artist placing the "shadow" of the American tragedies of the time upon his image (or rather, upon the replicated images). To use Jungian language, Warhol hides behind an illusory veil.[47] This veil, identical to a mask, signals a kind of game between the image and the "actor of his own face."[48] According to Hans Belting, the face and mask are intimately related, influencing and even replacing each other.[49] For Warhol, the self-shadow becomes a repetitive layer with overlapping meanings, similar to serigraphic prints. With the aid of the self-shadow, the artist seems to be working through the shock of the violent images present in the American media in the early 1960s. By evoking the visual dimension of the sense of loss, the self-shadow points us toward stories related to death or, as in Gray's case, to the boundary experience – the suspension between the world of the living and the dead. The visual-semantic shifting of the self-shadow's various layers resembles the layering of successive masks, and thus successive images, that make up Warhol's polymerized image.

DIARY

The dual ontology expressed in the photographic self-shadow, which sustains the tension between presence and absence as well as visibility and visuality, is specifically related to memory. Photographs, after all, are children of memories. They capture moments both less and more important to us by freezing a fraction of time, so that the moment lasts forever and the memory

---

[46] T. de Duve, R. Krauss, "Andy Warhol, or The Machine Perfected", *October* 1989, 48, p. 4.

[47] Jung, *Man and His Symbols*, p. 87.

[48] H. Belting, *Face and Mask: A Double History*, trans. T.S. Hansen, A.J. Hansen, Princeton 2017.

[49] Ibidem.

is not lost. For Nan Goldin,[50] they are a kind of diary in which she keeps numerous stories, bound together into a "story without end", continued by the artist to the present day.[51]

Goldin explains what a photographic diary is to her in the introduction to her magnum opus *The Ballad of Sexual Dependency*. In 1986, she wrote "The Ballad of Sexual Dependency is the diary I let people read. My written diaries are private […] My visual diary is public."[52] This artist's book collects stories of the New York queer scene, portraits of acquaintances from her native Boston, records of transgressive states of consciousness, visual attempts to put boundaries in love relationships, and, finally, intimate self-portraits. This was accentuated by both the AIDS epidemic in the United States, for many of the artist's friends passed away at a young age, as well as the suicide of her teenage sister Barbara. This was the most important and traumatic event affecting Goldin's life and her perception of the essence of photographic recording.[53]

Although the self-shadow in Goldin's photographs appears relatively infrequently,[54] it is an essential part of the artist's self-portrait oeuvre. As an index, it indicates her presence, attests to her participation in the moment, and reinforces the memory aspect of her work. On the self-shadow-diary axis stands the figure of a female photographer, of whom she wrote "[t]here is a popular notion, that the photographer is by nature a voyeur, the last one invited to the party. But I'm not crashing; this is my party."[55] Thus, for Goldin, photography becomes the expression of a sense of exercising control, shaping a narrative, and "directing" a scene unfolding before her eyes. One may ask, then, how does the self-shadow relate to the above statements? What does its presence in the photograph contribute, and how does the artist use shadow to construct a narrative of memory? The way Goldin proposes to receive her works transcends the traditional understanding of photography as an object intended only for viewing; in her case, it takes on a cinematic and musical quality. The artist states that the photographs synesthetically stimulate "true memory", as they connote color, smell, sound, physical presence, density and even taste.[56] Thus, within them there is a collaboration of multiple senses be-

---

[50] Nan Goldin, born in 1953.

[51] N. Goldin, *The Ballad of Sexual Dependency*, New York 1986, p. 6.

[52] Ibidem.

[53] C. Cotton, *The Photograph as Contemporary Art*, London 2004.

[54] Examples of self-shadows in Goldin's work include *Untitled*, Boston, 1990, and *Smoking in my room, The Priory Hospital*, London 2002.

[55] Goldin, *The Ballad…*, p. 6.

[56] Ibidem, p. 9.

longing to the haptic system.[57] The artist's exhibition practices became an expression of this thinking, and thus a moment of special engagement with the viewer. Charlotte Cotton recalls that Goldin's photographs were displayed as slideshows with the music selected by the photographer played from records in the background, and sometimes even shown in New York clubs on the Lower East Side accompanied by live music.[58] Moreover, in *The Ballad…* there is a clear division into themes, punctuated by songs assigned to the shots.

The 1978 photo *Kim and Mark in My Red Car, Newton, MA*, can be considered an elaboration of the above points (ill. 3). This is the only self-shadow photograph in *The Ballad…*, and it is additionally tagged with Nina Simone's song *I Put a Spell on You*. The shot is a portrait of friends driving in a car along a road in Newton, Massachusetts. The scene takes place in a car in daylight. The front seats are occupied by the titular Mark, the driver, and Kim, who is cuddling up to him. In the back of the car is the artist photographing the scene, betraying her presence through a self-shadow. It is cast onto the red seats and Kim's figure, creating the appearance of being divided into several zones. The artist's silhouette falls on contrasting materials – the leather upholstery of the seat, her friend's hair and her jacket. Goldin's characteristic bouffant of curls and the fact that she holds the camera at chest level creates the impression that there is no division between her head and body. It is her hair that becomes the most recognizable aspect of the photographer's silhouette.

Warmth radiates from the shot: the color scheme of the car's interior, the orange of the afternoon hour and the time of year make it so. The landscape visible through the windows is clearly autumnal, as revealed by the yellowed leaves. Light enters the car thanks to the raised sun visor, which is lowered on the passenger side. An intriguing element of the frame is the beam of light, which, like an arrow, approaches Goldin's self-shadow. A metal strip on the roof of the car and the fact that the artist has taken the back seat are visual boundaries separating the protagonists. The couple's moment of tenderness is expressed in a gesture of intimacy. There is an interesting detail on the axis of Goldin's self-shadow – the man's hand approaching Kim. Thus, this self-portrait not only points to the relevance of the haptic sense, but also to the appropriating power of the self-shadow, capable of visual penetration and touch. This conveys the impression that Goldin's photograph is a confession of love directed at her friends, especially Kim, who is the main recipient of the feelings expressed by the artist in the

---

[57] M. Smolińska, *Haptyczność poszerzona. Zmysł dotyku w sztuce polskiej drugiej połowy XX i początku XXI wieku*, Cracow 2020, p. 61.

[58] Cotton, *The Photograph…*

3. Nan Goldin, *Kim and Mark in the red car,* Newton, Mass, 1978, C-print, 40.3 x 50.8 cm, courtesy of the artist and Marian Goodman Gallery, © Nan Goldin

form of a self-shadow. In the scene arranged in the photograph, one can find echoes of Nina Simone's song, toward the end of which she sings the telling words "I love you anyhow | And I don't care | If you don't want me | I'm yours right now."[59] The lyrics highlight Goldin's distance from her potential beloved, as she is seated in the back of the car. The artist literally removes herself into the shadows, reconciled to the situation.

Memory appears to play a special role here. Goldin is storing the memory of their trip together as if it were to be their last. Although by positioning herself in the back seat of the car the artist tries to keep her distance from the depicted scene, her shadow does not allow her to do so. Metaphorically, she also partakes in the embrace shared by the couple. The musical reference emphasizes the sentimental dimension of the photograph and gives the shot a special atmosphere. The self-shadow, along with numerous visual-haptic signals, expands our reception to include tactile and even kinesthetic dimensions. Closeness, tenderness, warmth and love mingle with anxiety, uncertainty and detachment, creating a mosaic of emotions that we do not usually associate

[59] N. Simone, *I Put a Spell on You*, song released in 1965.

directly with the sight of a shadow. As Dean Martin once sang, memories are made up of grief and joy.[60] Goldin's photographs bring to this recipe a dose of effortless sincerity and a desire to share images from her life with others.

*

If one were to go back to the definition of the self-shadow and write it again, it might look like this: it is a self-governing, often uncontrollable, shape-shifting and ephemeral image, cast as both actor and performer in roles that speak to the human condition and the state of the arts. Finally, it is a creative tool that in the hands of photographers becomes a double index. The self-shadow has spurred the growth of new critical categories to help understand its presence in photographs. The myth of Narcissus, or rather its subversion that valorizes the silhouetted double, has become one of the main artistic inspirations. Gazing at the image of one's own shadow has led to a variety of insights. For some it constituted a moment of identity crisis and the realization of social invisibility, for others a moment of infatuation or a confession of love. Transplanting the myths of Butades' daughter or Narcissus into American self-portraiture has made it possible to see the work of selected artists in terms of a reflection or a twin and a mask. The category of the invisible man also drew on the topos of narcissistic identification while conveying the experience of the Black man, while the diary was an expression of a general appreciation of memories, mental images and haptic sensations. The particular interest in the self-shadow among the selected photographers can be explained by the nature of the time when their works were created, one which happened after modernism. At that time, the question of identity also became a question about the process of its construction, about the instability of the subject in the world, as well as about the changing roles of artists, which were dependent on the context – be it social, gender or racial. The self-shadow seems to fit into such a narrative, while remaining faithful to the symbolism of the shadow as it is known from the European tradition.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Baker G., "The Space of the Stain", *Grey Room* 2001, 5, pp. 7–37

Barthes R., *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. R. Howard, New York 1981

Baxandall M., *Shadows and Enlightenment*, New Haven–London 1995

Belting H., *Face and Mask: A Double History*, trans. T.S. Hansen, A.J. Hansen, Princeton 2017

[60] D. Martin, *Memories Are Made of This*, song released in 1955.

Bhabha H., *The Location of Culture*, London 2004
Bowyer S., "Seeing Double: The Subject of Vision in Lee Friedlander's Self-Portraiture", *photographies* 2020, 13(3), pp. 323–339
Burgin V., "Looking at Photographs", in: *Thinking Photography*, ed. V. Burgin, London 1982, pp. 142–153
Buse P., *The Camera Does the Rest. How Polaroid Changed Photography*, Chicago 2016
Casati R., P. Cavanagh, *The Visual World of Shadows*, Cambridge, Massachusetts 2019
Cotton C., *The Photograph as Contemporary Art*, London 2004
De Duve T., R. Krauss, "Andy Warhol, or The Machine Perfected", *October* 1989, 48, pp. 3–14
Didi-Huberman G., "The History of Art Within the Limits of Its Simple Practice", in: *Confronting Image: Questioning the Ends of a Certain History of Art*, trans. J. Goodman, Pennsylvania 2004, pp. 11–52
Doane M.A., "Indexicality: Trace and Sign: Introduction," *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 2007, 1(18), pp. 1–6
Doane M.A., "The Indexical and the Concept of Medium Specificity", *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 2007, 1(18), pp. 128–152
Eckhardt S.L., "An Introduction to Working Together", in: *Working Together: Louis Draper and the Kamoinge Workshop*, ed. S. Eckhardt, Durham 2020, pp. 9–15
Fanon F., *Black Skin, White Masks*, trans. C.L. Markman, London 1986
Foster H., "The Return of the Real", in: *The Return of the Real. The Avant-Garde at the End of the Century*, Cambridge–London 1996
Goldin N., *The Ballad of Sexual Dependency*, New York 1986
Gombrich E.H., *The Depiction of Cast Shadows in Western Art*, London 1995
Jung C.G., *Man and His Symbols*, New York–London–Toronto–Sydney–Auckland 1964
Kanaan H., *Photography and Its Shadow*, Palo Alto 2020
Kanicki W., *Ujemny biegun fotografii. Negatywowe obrazy w sztuce nowoczesnej*, Gdańsk 2016
Krauss R., "Notes on the Index: Seventies Art in America", *October* 1977, 3, available online: <https://doi.org/10.2307/778437>, pp. 68–81
Lacan J., *Seminar IX: Identification*, London 2002
Michałowska M., *Obraz utajony. Szkice o fotografii i pamięci*, Cracow 2007
Ovid, *Metamorphoses*, trans. A.S. Kline, Virginia 2004
Patnaik D.P., "Diasporic Double Vision, in: Committed to the Image", *Contemporary Black Photographers*, ed. B. Head Millstein, New York 2001, pp. 29–39
Plato, *The Republic*, trans. D. Lee, London 2007
Pliny, *The Natural History*, Book XXXV, trans. H. Rackham, London 1952
Silverman K., *The Threshold of the Visible World*, New York–London 1996
Smolińska M., "Efekt Narcyza. Metanarcyzm w sztuce wideo(instalacji)", in: *Projekt Narcyz*, ed. A. Bednarczyk, Cracow 2017, pp. 172–192
Smolińska M., *Haptyczność poszerzona. Zmysł dotyku w sztuce polskiej drugiej połowy XX i początku XXI wieku*, Cracow 2020
Stoichita V., *A Short History of the Shadow*, trans. A.M. Glasheen, London 1997

Swenson G., "What is Pop Art? Answers from 8 Painters", *Art News* 1963, 62, p. 26
Walker S.W., *Shadows and Reflections/Self-Portraits, Artist's Statement*, 1996, courtesy of the artist, pp. 1–2

Julia Stachura

Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznań

DOUBLE INDEX. SELF-SHADOW IN AMERICAN PHOTOGRAPHY OF THE SECOND HALF OF THE 20TH CENTURY

The article focuses on the notion of the image of self-shadow in American photography in the second half of the twentieth century, understood as a shadow silhouette of the creator captured in a photograph. The two main problems that concern the author's research are the lack of current, theoretical study on the problem of shadow in the history of photography from the perspective of art history (V. Stoichita, R. Casati, P. Cavanagh, H. Kanaan) and the lack of the definition of the phenomenon of self-shadow and its possible types in self-portraiture. The author's proposition of a definition of self-shadow is based on selected photographs by four artists whose works touch upon the problem of shadow in the context of relations between the "self" and the "other" (Lee Friedlander), race and subjective invisibility (Shawn W. Walker), mask and the other-self (Andy Warhol), and the intimate recording of identity (Nan Goldin). In her analyses, the author discusses the problem of the hybrid ontology of the shadow, which is both visible and visual. In this understanding, the shadow not only refers to a physical body, present "here and now" but more importantly evokes a sense of presence, even when the artist's body is absent in the picture. The double index refers to the image leaving its mark both in reality and on light-sensitive paper. The rudimentary, vitalistic relation linking the human body with its shadow is only a starting point for analyses of the complexity of its status and symbolism. The concepts framing Andy Warhol's Polaroid are twinning, the mask, and the Jungian theory of the shadow archetype. To discuss the self-portrait of Shawn W. Walker, the author applies the literary-philosophical concept of invisibility based on writings from Black existentialists (W.E.B. Du Bois, F. Fanon, R. Ellison). The analyses of Lee Friedlander's photograph have been based on the psychological distinction between the figures of the "self" and the "other". The closing concepts that frame Nan Goldin's self-portrait are the haptic thinking subject (M. Smolińska) and the notion of a diary. The critical apparatus of the study is supplemented by contemporary analyses of the myth of Narcissus, the mythical origins of the self-portrait, and the notion of the index (after R. Krauss, M. Michałowska, M.A. Doane).

Keywords:
self-shadow, self-portrait, index, photography, double