

MAŁGORZATA GRAJTER

The Grażyna and Kiejstut Bacewicz University of Music in Łódź
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5174-3504>

*Transcriptions, paraphrases and modern arrangements of vocal works by Stanisław Moniuszko: an outline of the issues and methodology of research**

ABSTRACT: The well-known practice of transcribing the most famous works by outstanding composers, especially for the piano, was one of the most widely used methods of popularising music in the 19th century. One can say that it had a similar function to literary translation – just as different language versions and adaptations prove the popularity of literary masterpieces, the fact that transcriptions (for piano, other instrument, or a different ensemble) were created was evidence of the particular interest of the audience. Apart from the composer himself, transcriptions and paraphrases of vocal works by Moniuszko were made by Henryk Melcer-Szczawiński, Władysław Krogulski, Zygmunt Noskowski, Ignaz Friedman, Maurice Dietrich, and others. Nowadays, the role the piano used to perform in a house has largely been replaced by the recording industry and modern media and access to music is unlimited in most countries. This situation significantly reduces the demand for creating “usable” versions of works by famous composers. So is there room for new arrangements of Moniuszko’s works on the modern music market? Jazz productions by Bogdan Halicki and the latest proposal from Włodek Pawlik prove that the problem of promoting music by this Polish composer remains valid – and as time goes by, there is a growing need to adjust these compositions to the tastes of modern audiences. The aim of this article is to characterise transcriptions and arrangements of vocal works by Stanisław Moniuszko and to show different transformations of the original pieces depending on their functions and potential listeners by analogy with literary translation.

KEYWORDS: Stanisław Moniuszko, vocal music, songs, opera, arrangement, transcription, translation theory

One of the most crucial questions that Moniuszko scholars are currently asking themselves concerns the form in which the composer’s music reaches the ears of a contemporary listener. It turns out that we very often hear Moni-

¹The Polish version of this article, under the title ‘Transkrypcje, parafrazy i nowoczesne aranżacje utworów wokalnych Stanisława Moniuszki – zarys problematyki i metodologia badań’, was first published in *Notes Muzyczny*, 1/19 (2023): 77–88, <https://doi.org/10.5604/01.3001.0053.6739>.

uszko in a version more or less far removed from the original, as in the case of the composer's scores which have been repeatedly reworked and re-instrumented. Since it is only in recent years that intense work on reconstructing the authentic versions of Moniuszko's stage works has been undertaken, the aspiration to authenticity comes to the fore in the research paradigm; at the same time, all kinds of interference, adaptations and new versions are treated as something highly suspicious, or at least inferior to the original. An analogous situation concerns literary translation; the similar sound of the words 'translator' and 'traitor' in some languages (besides English, also the Italian 'traduttore' and 'traditore', and the French 'traducteur' and 'traître') symbolically expresses a negative connotation linked to the translation of a text into a foreign language. In the case of music, the treachery would mean a sort of falsification of the musical content, a lack of faithfulness in relation to the composer's original score, and in effect a change in the sound of a work.

Another frequently employed stereotype is the conviction of the secondary status of a translation. Hilaire Belloc (1959 [1931], p. 83) once wrote that 'the art of translation is a subsidiary art and derivative. On this account it has never been granted the dignity of original work, and has suffered too much in the general judgement of letters'. From the point of view of the history of a work's reception, however, distancing oneself from 'secondary literature' is inappropriate. As Maciej Gołąb (2012, p. 85) states, 'for the history of reception, all texts contributing to the social history of a work's functioning are equally important'. The practice of transcribing – above all for piano – the most famous works by outstanding composers, particularly popular during the nineteenth century, has been one of the most readily used forms of popularising music, enabling it – like a literary translation – to reach potential performers or listeners who very often would not be able to acquaint themselves with the original version.

The clear move away from the negative appraisal of both phenomena has resulted on one hand in the emergence in the 1970s of Translation Studies as a separate academic discipline and on the other in renewed interest in research into musical transcriptions and arrangements. In the case of Moniuszko's works, this subject has been signalled thus far in only a few fragmentary studies. Many questions, linked to both the object of study and to its systematics, remain open – hence the idea for the present text, which represents an attempt to summarise existing knowledge and to set out the direction for further studies into Moniuszko's music translated into a different medium or musical genre.

One of the most debatable questions remains that of terminology. In her article devoted to Melcer's transcriptions of works by Moniuszko, Chmara-Żaczekiewicz (1977) stresses the interchangeability of the terms 'transcription' and 'paraphrase'. She refrains from defining them on account of the inconsistent use of them by publishers, among others. So with the aim of painting a fuller panorama of the notions associated with transformations of original versions of works, one must go beyond the narrow field of Moniuszko studies and refer to such studies as Barbara Literska's work on transcriptions of works by Chopin (Literska, 2020), but here too the conclusion arises that there is a lack of clear-cut, unequivocal definitions, particularly in the Polish language, of arrangement and transcription.

A large proportion of these phenomena are of a typically recreative character, and the idea is simply to transfer the work as faithfully as possible to a different performance apparatus. At the other end of the scale, so essentially bordering on original creative output – with considerable input from the creative imagination of the person producing the new version of a work – stand such phenomena as paraphrase, fantasia, improvisation, reminiscence and potpourri. So it is often – though not always – the criterion of faithfulness to or departure from the original that determines a work's classification to a particular category.

The need to distinguish between these notions and the resultant danger of oversimplification is entirely eliminated if we accept that all these phenomena may be defined collectively as musical translation. This line of thinking has been used in their works by such authors as Jonathan Kregor (2010) and Gabrielle Kaufman (2017). Common to literary and musical translations is the capturing and recreation of a given work in its entirety (or a substantial part), as well as transformation of one sort or another, depending on the target language or forces, or else on the musical style or circumstances of time, place and intention conditioning the creation of the new version.

A separate question concerns the repertoire in question, as well as the composers of Moniuszko arrangements. Listed below are the most important transcriptions of works by Moniuszko, classified according to composer. The list contains only published works,² while many manuscripts and sketches have yet to be studied.

Michał Marian Biernacki (1855–1936)

Dumka in D minor 'Nie śpię, nie jem' [I can't sleep, I can't eat] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1905).

Zosia's dumka from the opera *Flis* [*The Raftsmen*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1898).

'Zosia' from Adam Mickiewicz's play *Dziady* [*Forefathers' Eve*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1905).

'Groźna dziewczyna' [Fierce lass] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1905).

'O matko moja' [O mother of mine] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1905).

'Śpiewak w obcej stronie' [A singer abroad] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1898).

Maurycy Dietrich (1816–1887)

'Pieśń wieczorna' [Evening song], Op. 64 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1890)

'Prząśniczka' [The spinstress]; 'Złota rybka' [The goldfish], Op. 68 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1880)

² Unless otherwise stated, the information in this list is based on the holdings of the Polona digital archive of the National Library of Poland.

Excerpts from *Straszny dwór* [*The Haunted Manor*]:

‘Pieśń Zbigniewa’ [Zbigniew’s song]; ‘Pożegnanie’ [Farewell], Op. 50 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1880)

Duettino; Quartet, Op. 51 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1880)

‘Aria z kurantem’ [Carillon aria], Op. 52 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1870)

Ignacy Friedman (1882–1948)

Trois transcriptions de concert d’après St. Moniuszko, Op. 28.

No. 1. ‘Wiosna’ [Spring] (Kraków: A. Piwarski & Co., [not before 1912])

No. 2. ‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song] (Kraków: A. Piwarski & Co., [c.1910])

No. 3. ‘Dumka’ (Kraków: A. Piwarski & Co., [1909])³

Władysław Krogulski (1843–1934)

Zosia’s dumka from *Flis* [*The Raftsmen*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1910)

‘Złota rybka’ [The goldfish] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1915)

‘Pieśń pokutna’ [Penitential song] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1905)

‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1915)

‘Piosenka żołnierza’ [Soldier’s song] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1919)

‘Szumią jodły’ [The firs sigh] from *Halka* (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1912)

‘Pieśń Flisa’ [The raftsmen’s song] from *Flis* [*The Raftsmen*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1912)

‘Czarny krzyżyk’ [A little black cross] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff c.1905)

Le carillon: Romance favorite de l’opera “Le chateau mysterieux” (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1922)

Air de l’op. „La Comtesse”: *Zbudzić się z ułudnych snów* [To wake from these delusive dreams] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff c.1905)

Hrabina: Pan Chorąży [*The Countess: Horatio’s polonaise*] – polonaise from Act 3 (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1922).

‘Modlitwa Pańska’ [The Lord’s Prayer] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1905).

‘Znasz-li ten kraj’ [Knowst thou the land?] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1915).

‘Prząśniczka’ [The spinstress] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1912).

Verbum Nobile – Stanisław’s song (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910).

Halka: Przed ołtarzem stoją razem [They’re standing together at the altar];
Ojczyźnie Boże Panie [Our Father in heaven, dear Lord] (Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910)

‘Stary kapral’ [The old corporal] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910).

‘O władco świata’ [O ruler of the world] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910).⁴

³ Friedman’s transcriptions were regarded as worthy of mention in an international list of the most popular piano transcriptions produced by Hinson (1991, p. 93).

⁴ It is worth mentioning that Władysław’s elder brother, Józef Władysław Krogulski, also arranged the Mazur from *Halka* for mandolin (Warsaw: Grąbczewski, 1928), held in the National Library.

Henryk Melcer-Szczawiński (1869–1928)

*Variations sur un thème de St. Moniuszko 'Le cosaque' (c.1898)*⁵

'Znasz-li ten kraj' [Knowst thou the land?] (c.1898)

Dumka (c.1898)

'Prząśniczka' [The spinstress] (c.1898)

'Wiosna' [The spring] (c.1889)

'Pieśń wieczorna' [Evening song] (c.1898)

'Groźna dziewczyna' [Fierce lass] (c.1899)

'Stary kapral' [The old corporal] (c.1902)⁶

Stanisław Moniuszko (self-transcriptions)

'Aria z kurantami' [Carillon aria] from *Straszny dwór* [*The Haunted Manor*];
EM No. 3 (Warsaw, 1877)

Jawnuta [excerpts] (Vilnius: G. Sonnenfeld, 1860)

Mazur from *Halka* (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1858)

Mazur from *Straszny dwór* [*The Haunted Manor*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff,
1865)

Ballet music from *Hrabina* [*The Countess*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1960)

Polonaise from *Halka* (Vilnius, 1850)

Concert polonaise in A major (Warsaw: F. Hoesick, 1866)

Polka from themes from *Flis* [*The Raftsmen*] (Warsaw: G. Sonnenfeld, 1858)⁷

Zygmunt Noskowski (1849–1906)For orchestra

Collection of 15 songs and arias entitled *Perły Moniuszkowskie* [Moniuszko pearls] (autogr. 1903 at CBN-PWN): 1. 'Maciek', 2. 'Czy wróci' [Will he return?], 3. 'Kwiatek' [Little flower], 4. 'Wesół i szczęśliwy' [Happy and cheerful], 5. 'Stary kapral' [The old corporal], 6. 'Znasz-li ten kraj' [Knowst thou the land?], 7. 'Motyl' [The butterfly], 8. 'Kum i kuma' [Two chums], 9. 'Nad Nidą' [On the Nida], 10. 'Halko miła' [Dear Halka], 11. 'Wróżba znachora' [The folk healer's augury], 12. 'Krakowiak', 13. 'Kozak' [The Cossack], 14. 'Mazurek', 15. 'Stary hulaka' [The old carouser].

'Piosnka żołnierza' [Soldier's song] (Wrocław: J. Hainauer, c.1881; with arr. for violin and piano and for solo piano)

'Dary' [The gifts] and 'Morel' [The apricot] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff c.1900) (See Wroński, 1960, pp. 108–119; cf. Negrey, 2002, p. 103)

For piano

Trois chansons de Moniuszko (London: Augener, n.d.; later Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff):

⁵ Not entirely accurately classified as transcriptions (see Chmara-Żaczekiewicz, 1977, pp. 43–44).

⁶ Dated on the basis of Piątkowska-Pińczewska (2002, p. 235).

⁷ Cited after Duszyk (2000, p. 326).

1. 'L'abricot' [The apricot], 2. 'L'oiselet de passage' [Wandering bird], 3. 'Les dons' [The gifts]
Pieśni (pub. S. Sadowski?): 1. 'Piosnka żołnierza' [Soldier's song], 2. 'Kum i kuma'
 [Two chums], 3. 'Stary hulaka' [The old carouser], 4. 'Skowronek' [The lark], 5.
 'Czy powróci' [Will he return?], 6. Mazurek (see Wroński, 1960, pp. 147–148).

For choir

Osiem pieśni [Eight songs] (1896–97) (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff 1900): 1.
 'Wróżby znachora' [The folk healer's augury], 2. 'Stary hulaka' [The old carouser], 3. 'Morel'
 [The apricot], 4. 'Dzieweczka nad rzeką' [A girl by the river], 5. 'Dwie zorze'
 [Two dawns], 6. 'Skowronek' [The lark], 7. 'Brzózka' [The little birch], 8. 'Mazurek'.

Moje bogactwa [My riches] (Warsaw: Chór, 1938) (see Wroński, 1960, pp. 134–135).

Bernhard Wolff (1835–1906)⁸

L'aurore et la jeune fille = Dwie zorze [Two dawns] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1900).

'Znasz-li ten kraj' [Knowst thou the land?] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, Kraków, 1898)

Dumka 'Przychodź miły dzień już biały' [Dumka 'Come my love, the day has dawned] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, Kraków, 1897)

'Kozak' [The Cossack] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, 1903).

'Gwiazdka' [The little star] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910).

'Kwiatek' [The little flower] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1905).

'Serce moje' [My heart] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, c.1905).

Le ménétrier = Grajek [The minstrel] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, Kraków, 1897)

Hrabina: Zbudzić się z uludnych snów [*The Countess: "To wake from these delusive dreams"*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, after 1910)

Halka: Gdyby rannym słońkiem [*Halka: "If in the morning sunshine"*] (Warsaw: Gebethner & Wolff, not before 1922)

This list clearly shows that the greatest number of transcriptions of works by Moniuszko, in the traditional understanding of the word, were written not long after his death, around the turn of the twentieth century. Many of them – particularly arrangements for piano – were published regularly by Gebethner & Wolff up to around the 1920s. With time, the popularity of this form of propagating the Polish composer's works began to wane. However, in post-war times, so during the second half of the twentieth century, modern arrangements of Moniuszko's works began to appear, often representing a cross with popular

⁸Works by Moniuszko were also arranged by such composers as Wincenty Adamowski, Jan Konopasek, Wilhelm Krüger, Jan Łusakowski, Jan Adam Maklakiewicz, Piotr Maszyński, Roman Monczyński, Józef Nowakowski, Henryk Pachulski, Eugen de Westh and Nicolai von Wilm. This is certainly not an exhaustive list of names.

music. This is a current linked above all to the spread of mass media and culture. Particularly noteworthy are the following modern takes on Moniuszko's works.

Jazz

Bogdan Halicki, *Jazz i Moniuszko* [Jazz and Moniuszko] (1998, Selles Records)

Paweł Pańta – double bass, bass guitar; Bogdan Halicki – drums, artistic director; Fryderyk Babiński – piano

Songs ('Prząśniczka', 'Kozak', 'Co to za kwiatek', 'Gdyby mnie kto kochał szczerze', 'Latem brzoźka mała z liściem rozmawiała', 'O matko moja', 'Pieśń wieczorna' [The spinstress, The Cossack, What flower is this?, If someone truly loved me, In the summer a little birch spoke with a leaf, O mother of mine, Evening song]) and excerpts from the operas ('Szumią jodły' [The firs sough] – Jontek's aria from *Halka*, 'Spod igielek kwiaty rosną' [Stitch by stitch on a string] – chorus from *Straszny dwór* [The Haunted Manor], 'Gdyby rannym słońkiem' [If in the morning sunshine] – Halka's aria from *Halka*, 'Piosenka Broni' [Bronia's song] from *Hrabina* [The Countess], 'Ten zegar stary' [This grandfather clock] – Skołuba's aria from *Straszny dwór* [The Haunted Manor], first theme from the overture to *Paria* [The Pariah]).

Włodek Pawlik, *Pawlik / Moniuszko. Polish jazz* (2019, Pawlik Relations)

Włodek Pawlik – piano, artistic direction, Paweł Pańta – double bass, Adam Zagórski – drums, percussion.

'Prząśniczka' [The spinstress], 'Szumią jodły na gór szczyście' [The firs sough on the mountain top] from *Halka*, 'Ten zegar stary' [This grandfather clock] from *Straszny dwór* [The Haunted Manor], 'Znasz-li ten kraj' [Knowst thou the land?], 'Gdyby rannym słońkiem' [If in the morning sunshine] from *Halka*, 'Pieśń wieczorna' [Evening song], 'Kum i kuma' [Two chums], 'Matko! Już nie ma Cię' [Mother! You're gone], 'Aria z kurantem' [Carillon aria] from *Straszny dwór* [The Haunted Manor].

Pop

Irena Santor & Anawa

***Przeboje pana Stanisława* [Stanisław's hits] (1982, Polskie Nagrania Muza – vinyl),**

***Przeboje pana Moniuszki* [Moniuszko's hits] (1998, Polskie Nagrania Muza – CD)**

‘Wiosna’ [The spring], ‘Matysek’, ‘Gdyby kto mnie kochał szczerze’ [If someone loved me truly], ‘Święty Piotr’ [Saint Peter], ‘Złota rybka’ [The goldfish], ‘Dalibógże’ [Upon my word], ‘Prząśniczka’ [The spinstress], ‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song], ‘Słoneczko’ [Sunshine], ‘Groźna dziewczyna’ [Fierce lass], ‘Kolęda’ [Carol], ‘Ja ciebie Kocham’ [I love you], ‘Powiedzcie mi’ [Tell me], ‘Dumka’, ‘Grajek’ [The player].

Ethnic music

Maria Pomianowska and friends, *Moniuszko z 1000 i jednej nocy* [Moniuszko from a thousand nights and one night] (2019, POL-CANART)

S. Moniuszko: ‘Prząśniczka’ [The spinstress], ‘Znasz-li ten kraj’ [Knowst thou the land?], ‘Rada’ [Counsel], ‘Kozak’ [The Cossack], ‘Triolet’ [Triplet], ‘Dumka’, ‘Swaty’ [The ambush], ‘Złota rybka’ [The goldfish], ‘Nawrócona’ [Converted], ‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song], ‘Ten zegar stary’ [This grandfather clock],
M. Pomianowska: ‘Pari Banu’.

Electronic music

Agata Zubel, Cezary Duchnowski, Andrzej Bauer: *Moniuszko E-śpiewnik* [Moniuszko E-songbook] (2019, Anaklasis-PWM)

‘Łza’ [A tear], Songbook VII, words by unknown
‘Ja Ciebie Kocham’ [I love you], Songbook XII, words by Adam Asnyk
‘Duettino’, Songbook V, words by Adam Mickiewicz
‘Dumka’, Songbook V, words by Jan Czeczot
‘Czy powróci’ [Will he return?], Songbook II, words by Józef Ignacy Kraszewski
‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song], Songbook II, words by Ludwik Kondratowicz (pseud. Władysław Syrokomla)
‘Księżyc i rzeczka’ [The moon and the river], Songbook III, words by A. Sowa
‘Prząśniczka’ [The spinstress], Songbook III, words by Jan Czeczot
‘Nawrócona’ [Converted], Songbook III, words by Johann Wolfgang Goethe in a translation by Kazimierz Brodziński
‘Luli’ [Lullaby] – Songbook III, words by Ludwik Kondratowicz (pseud. Władysław Syrokomla)
‘Powiedzcie mi’ [Tell me], Songbook VII, words by unknown
‘Pieśń pustelnika’ [Song of the hermit], Songbook VII, words by Adam Mickiewicz

Even from such a summary list of the most important transcriptions and arrangements of Moniuszko’s works, which gives no idea of how many there actually are, we can distinguish a group of works which have been arranged more often than others. In her monograph devoted to nineteenth-century pianism,

Irena Poniatowska (1991, p. 312; cf. 2011, p. 284) emphasises that arrangements and adaptations ‘played a similar role in music-making in the home as radio, discs and tapes play during the [twentieth] century’, and as the Internet also – and most prominently – plays today. So in their dissemination, we can discern the beginnings of the development of mass culture, corresponding to the musical pop culture of today. Hence the popularisation of works in the form of various arrangements could often have exerted a decisive influence on determining which of them entered the collective awareness as the composer’s best known and most valuable works, thereby gaining – to use pop nomenclature – hit status. They include such songs as the *Dumka* in A minor, ‘Prząśniczka’ [The spinstress], ‘Kozak’ [The Cossack], ‘Stary kapral’ [The old corporal], ‘Piosnka żołnierza’ [Soldier’s song], ‘Groźna dziewczyna’ [Fierce lass], ‘Pieśń wieczorna’ [Evening song], ‘Znasz-li ten kraj’ [Knowst thou the land?], ‘O matko moja’ [O mother of mine], ‘Wiosna’ [The spring], ‘Ja ciebie kocham’ [I love you], ‘Nawrócona’ [Converted], ‘Czy powróci?’ [Will he return?] and ‘Grajek’ [The player], and excerpts from the operas *Halka* (‘Gdyby ranny słońkiem’ [If with the morning sun], ‘Szumią jodły na gór szczycie’ [The firs sigh on the mountain top]), *Straszny dwór* [*The Haunted Manor*] (‘Ten zegar stary’ [This grandfather clock], ‘Aria z kurantem’ [Carillon aria]), *Hrabina* [*The Countess*] (‘Zbudzić się z ułudnych snów’ [To wake from these delusive dreams]) and *Flis* [*The Raftsman*] (‘Zosia’s *Dumka*’).

The existence of different variant arrangements of the same work also creates a pretext for comparative research, which enables us to define not only the specificities of particular arrangements, but also those features of an original composition which, despite repeated interference, remain unaltered, constituting its core, which determines the work’s identity and distinctiveness. Translation scholars call this the ‘invariant content’ (Bassnett, 2002, p. 35). The question remains as to the extent to which this notion can be applied to the musical work and which of its elements should remain unaltered for a new version to be relatively equiponderant in relation to the original. In reference to nineteenth-century transcriptions, Kregor (2010) draws attention to four basic elements: melody, harmony, articulation and texture. In practice, that hierarchy is sometimes preserved only in part – both melody and harmony may become simpler or more elaborate, and that does not yet disturb the integrity of the work. A similar situation occurs in relation to rhythmic changes: in modern versions of Moniuszko’s works, we find, for example, a change of metre from triple to duple (e.g. ‘This grandfather clock’ in the interpretations of Włodek Pawlik, Maria Pomianowska and Paweł Dudek (pseud. Czadoman) or vice versa. New arrangements can also foreground features which were hidden or less prominent in the original. One example of this is Maria Pomianowska’s interpretation of the work ‘Triplet’: the opening quotation from the Korean melody *Arirang* passes into the first phase of Moniuszko’s song, based on a pentatonic scale. In the original, within the context of the tonal harmony, the pentatonic character of the initial motif is barely noticeable, but juxtaposed with the oriental melody it becomes remarkably distinct. A similar thing occurs when, for example, in a piano accompaniment, we find illustrative elements that impose a specific kind of instrumentation, such as figures imitating a snare drum tremolo in the song ‘The Old Corporal’, strikingly

brought out by Zygmunt Noskowski in his orchestral cycle *Moniuszko Pearls*. It would appear, therefore, that one crucial aspect of work on a transcription is the skilful interpretation of hidden meanings and suggestions in the original score.

In his book on the analysis of a musical work from an epistemological perspective, Maciej Gołąb (2012, pp. 84–85) considers that ‘the great renaissance of the transcription observed in recent years requires [...] basic taxonomical decisions, since it is clear that they are becoming at least as attractive for research as the “original works”’. In response to that observation, the author undertook to construct a typology of the transcription, distinguishing different kinds with regard to the treatment of the following elements: substance, texture, syntax, form and expression. Literska (2020), meanwhile, in the conclusion to her study of Chopin transcriptions, employs the criterion of the degree to which the original is modified or transformed – from impoverishment through equality to enrichment, similar to that which the Slovakian translation theorist Anton Popovič proposes in relation to the translation: ‘under-interpretation’, ‘adequate interpretation’ and ‘over-interpretation’ (Popovič, 1975, p. 131).

The first of these types, defined as ‘under-interpretation’ or ‘impoverished translation’, may concern textural simplification (e.g. Jan Łusakowski’s piano arrangement of ‘Dumka’⁹) or the reduction of elements of form, such as the omission of an introduction or of another section of a composition (e.g. the piano arrangement of the song ‘Knowst thou the land?’ edited by Feliks Grąbczewski and Ignacy Rzepecki). ‘Adequate interpretation’, or ‘equivalent transcription’, is one in which, against the essential adaptation of textural features, the basic syntactic features are retained. One such example is Jan Adam Maklakiewicz’s arrangement of the song ‘Knowst thou the land?’ for mixed choir, with an additionally texted introduction.¹⁰ In the case of instrumental transcriptions of stanzaic songs, it sometimes happens that the original strophic form of the work is transformed into a stanzaic-variation type. The model of the variation-based arrangement of a strophic song became fully established in the transcriptions of Ferenc Liszt, and one consequence of this is that one can have difficulty in distinguishing such an arrangement from variations – as in the case of Melcer-Szczawiński’s Variations on ‘The Cossack’. Yet since the element of variation makes up for the lack of a text, we may regard this kind of transcription as complete or equivalent. Finally, the ‘over-interpretation’ or ‘enriching transcription’ may concern two areas: the enhancement of the texture, sometimes combined with the enrichment of the harmonic layer (as in Ignaz Friedman’s masterful arrangement of ‘Evening Song’), and the expansion of the form (as with Maurice Dietrich’s addition of an introduction to his arrangement of ‘Evening Song’ and Melcer-Szczawiński’s expansion of the climax in his arrangement of the song ‘Knowst thou the land?’¹¹). Of course, mixed types combining different kinds of transcription may also occur.

⁹ Published after 1905 in the series “Młody Muzyk” [‘The Young Musician’] in Michał Arct Press (Warszawa).

¹⁰ This work was published as a supplement to the periodical *Chór*, 3/4 (1 April 1936).

¹¹ Published after 1901 in Gebethner and Wolff Press (Warszawa).

In his studies on translation, Popovič (1971, 1975) has also addressed the kind of expressive changes to which the translation is subject, distinguishing three different kinds: adaptation (depending on intention), modernisation (linked to the chronological aspect) and localisation (linked to geographic or cultural area). This classification can also be applied to musical transformations:

- adaptation (Ger. *Sachbezug*): for example, adapting the degree of complexity to the capabilities of the performers (e.g. Zygmunt Noskowski's 'Soldier's Song' for an album of Moniuszko works adapted for children)
- modernisation (Ger. *Zeitbezug*): employing modern instrumental forces and sonorities, as well as a number of stylistic adaptations (e.g. Włodek Pawlik, Agata Zubel)
- localisation (Ger. *Ortbezug*): employing instruments typical of different cultures (Maria Pomianowska)

To conclude, the use of methodology from translation studies enables us to cover in our research both arrangements and transcriptions of Moniuszko's works as traditionally understood and also their modern versions. It should be emphasised that one and the other may constitute a creative response to present-day challenges linked to the popularisation of the Polish composer's music. Piano versions of his songs contain considerable potential with regard to propagating Moniuszko's works abroad. By eliminating the textual layer of works, problematic from an international point of view, the music becomes absolute and can be better appreciated by listeners unfamiliar with the Polish language. On the other hand, in the age of generally accessible media, the character of Moniuszko arrangements is changing significantly: the need arises for arrangements to be adapted to the growing demands of the market and to meet the expectations of listeners to non-classical music. Finally, unusual combinations of instruments and their exotic sounds enable arrangers to bring closer together musical cultures which are seemingly very distant from one another, for example through the participation in recordings of artists normally performing folk and ethical music from different countries. These propositions certainly depart from Moniuszko's original works to a considerable degree, but at the same time they create the possibility that an interested listener will eventually turn to the original and be able to recognise it.

Translated by John Comber

References

- Bassnett, S. (2002). *Translation Studies*. London: Routledge.
- Belloc, H. (1959). On Translation. *The Bible Translator*, 10(1): pp. 83–100.
- Chmara-Żaczekiewicz, B. (1977). Transkrypcje fortepianowe Melcera w świetle transkrypcji Liszta [Melcer's piano transcriptions in light of Liszt's transcriptions]. In *Muzyka fortepianowa*, 3, (pp. 41–56). Gdańsk: Akademia Muzyczna im. Stanisława Moniuszki.
- Chór*, 3/4 (1 April 1936).

- Duszyk, K. (Ed.). (2000). Stanisław Moniuszko [catalogue of works]. In E. Dziębowska (Ed.). *Encyklopedia muzyczna PWM* [PWM music encyclopaedia], biographical part, vi (pp. 307–327, 333–335). Kraków: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne.
- Gołąb, M. (2012). *Spór o granice poznania dzieła muzycznego* [The dispute over the epistemological limits to music analysis]. Toruń: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UMK.
- Hinson, M. (1990). *The Pianist's Guide to Transcriptions, Arrangements and Paraphrases*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Kaufman, G. (2017). *Gaspar Cassadó: Cellist, Composer and Transcriber*. London: Routledge.
- Kregor, J. (2010). *Liszt as Transcriber*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Literska, B. (2020). *Nineteenth-Century Transcriptions of Works by Fryderyk Chopin*, (J. Comber, Transl.). Berlin: Peter Lang.
- Negrey, M. (2002). Zygmunt Noskowski. In E. Dziębowska (Ed.). *Encyklopedia muzyczna PWM* [PWM music encyclopaedia], biographical part, vii (pp. 95–106). Kraków: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne.
- Piątkowska-Pińczewska K. (2002). *Henryk Melcer-Szczawiński. Życie i twórczość* [Henryk Melcer-Szczawiński: his life and work]. Kalisz: Instytut Pedagogiczno-Artystyczny UAM.
- Polona Digital Library. (2023, July 24). <https://polona.pl>.
- Poniatowska, I. (1991). *Muzyka fortepianowa i pianistyka XIX wieku. Aspekty artystyczne i społeczne* [Nineteenth-century piano music and pianism]. Warszawa: Rewasz.
- Poniatowska, I. (2011). *Romanticism, Part 2A 1850–1900: Musical Output* (J. Comber, Transl.). Warszawa: Sutkowski Edition.
- Popovič, A. (1971). *Poetika umeleckého prekladu. Proces a text* [The poetics of artistic translation: process and text]. Bratislava: Tatran.
- Popovič, A. (1975). *Teória umeleckého prekladu: Aspekty textu a literárnej metakomunikácie* [Theory of artistic translation: aspects of the text and literary metacommunication]. Bratislava: Tatran.
- Wroński, W. (1960). *Zygmunt Noskowski*. Kraków: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne.